

BOARD OFFICIAL

NHSGGC SGC(M)23/02  
Minutes: 15-30

NHS GREATER GLASGOW AND CLYDE

**Minutes of a Meeting of the  
NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde  
Staff Governance Committee  
held in the JB Russell House Boardroom and via Microsoft Teams, on  
Tuesday 23 May at 1.30pm**

**PRESENT**

K Miles (Co-Chair in the Chair)  
A Cameron-Burns (Co-Chair)  
M Ashraf  
Cllr C McDiarmid  
Dr P Ryan  
C Vincent  
J Grant (Chief Executive)

**IN ATTENDANCE**

M Allen	Senior Administrator
Dr J Armstrong	Medical Director (Item 23)
K Berchtenbreiter	Head of Human Resources – Corporate Services (Item 20)
F Carmichael	Acute Partnership Representative
B Culshaw	Chief Officer, West Dunbartonshire Health and Social Care Partnership (HSCP)
K Donald	Board Secretary (Item 27)
G Gall	Head of Human Resources – West Dunbartonshire HSCP (Item 20)
D Hudson	Staff Experience Adviser / iMatter Operational Lead
A Gibson	Chief Risk Officer
Dr U Graham	Consultant in General Adult Psychiatry / Secondary Care Appraisal Lead (Item 23)
A MacPherson	Director of Human Resources and Organisational Development
S Munce	Head of Workforce Planning and Resources
C Rennie	Workforce Planning and Information Manager
L Spence	Head of Staff Experience
E Quail	Staff Side Partnership Lead for APF
Prof A Wallace	Board Nurse Director
A Walton	Staff Side Partnership Lead for APF

15.	<b>WELCOME AND APOLOGIES</b>	<b>ACTION BY</b>
	<p>K Miles welcomed all to the meeting, introducing M Ashraf as a new member of the Staff Governance Committee.</p> <p>Apologies were noted for Prof Brown, F Shennan, Cllr McGinty, E Vanhegan and A McCready.</p>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

<b>16.</b>	<b>DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST</b>		
	There were no formal declarations of interest intimated.		
<b>17.</b>	<b>MINUTES</b>		
	<p>The Minutes of the Committee meeting held on 21 February 2023 (SGC(M)23/01) were approved as a correct record. The motion to approve was intimated by Dr Ryan and seconded by Cllr McDiarmid.</p> <p><u>APPROVED</u></p>		
<b>18.</b>	<b>MATTERS ARISING</b>		
	<u>Rolling Action List</u>		
	<p>K Miles referred to the Rolling Action List (Paper 23/08) and advised that there was one item, with it being marked for closure.</p> <p>The Committee noted the updated Rolling Action List and agreed the item proposed for closure.</p> <p><u>APPROVED</u></p>		
<b>19.</b>	<b>URGENT ITEMS OF BUSINESS</b>		
	<p><u>Industrial Action Update</u></p> <p>A MacPherson advised that the Scottish Government have made a revised pay offer to Junior Doctors and Dentists. The British Medical Association has put forward the offer to its members, with a response expected towards the end of June 2023.</p> <p>E Quail asked about the impact of potential industrial action on other Trade Union members, with A MacPherson confirming that this has been considered as part of contingency planning with Senior Management Teams and leaders across the organisation.</p>		

<p><b>20.</b></p>	<p><b>ASSURANCE PRESENTATION</b></p> <p><u>West Dunbartonshire HSCP</u></p> <p>B Culshaw, Chief Officer, West Dunbartonshire HSCP supported by G Gall (Head of Human Resources – West Dunbartonshire HSCP), gave a presentation on the Staff Governance activity within the HSCP. This provided an overview of key workforce metrics, including sickness absence, Statutory and Mandatory training, KSF compliance and iMatter participation, outlining the actions being undertaken within the Directorate to meet the agreed targets.</p> <p>B Culshaw outlined how the activity streams met the five strands of the Staff Governance Standard and highlighted key achievements, including development and launch of the Workforce Plan, improved communication channels, a new Health and Care Centre in Clydebank, embedding the Clinical Care and Governance Committee across the HSCP and development sessions for Senior and wider Management Teams.</p> <p>B Culshaw advised the Staff Governance Committee that there are a number of continuous improvement opportunities for the HSCP over the next 18 months. These include improved Personal Development Planning and Review conversations, continuing to develop a ‘trauma informed’ organisation to support staff and promoting completion of iMatter action plans, sharing themes and actions.</p> <p>B Culshaw showcased Musculoskeletal Physiotherapy Wellbeing as the HSCP’s case study. The service focusses on the wellbeing of staff, taking a five strand approach – Awareness, Learning, Physical Activity, Connection and Kindness. Feedback from staff has been positive, with plans to build on this work through ‘What Matters to You?’ day, Staff Stress Audit feedback and trauma informed workforce training and development.</p> <p>A MacPherson asked if the approach in the case study could be widened to other groups, with B Culshaw advising that consideration is being given to replicating the approach in some of the more operational focussed areas.</p>	
-------------------	--	--

BOARD OFFICIAL

Prof Wallace commending the work being done in West Dunbartonshire HSCP and asked what the impact of trauma informed practice had been to date. B Culshaw advised that there has been an increased awareness amongst staff and an interest in the impact on service delivery.

K Miles asked what further the Directorate could do to increase Performance Development Planning and Review compliance, with B Culshaw highlighting that following the impact of COVID-19, there was an increased refocus on this area.

Public Health Directorate

Dr Crighton, Interim Director of Public Health, supported by K Berchtenbreiter, Head of Human Resources – Corporate Services, gave a presentation on the Staff Governance activity within the Public Health Directorate. This provided an overview of key workforce metrics, including sickness absence, Statutory and Mandatory training, KSF compliance and iMatter participation, outlining the actions being undertaken within the Directorate to meet the agreed targets.

Dr Crighton outlined how the activity streams met the five strands of the Staff Governance Standard and highlighted key achievements, including participation and engagement in Investors in People accreditation (Corporate Cluster), establishment of a Directorate Staff Forum, creation of a Public Health Directorate Monthly Team Brief and creation of a Refreshed Operational Plan, with a focus on clearer decision making and communication within the Directorate.

Dr Crighton advised the Staff Governance Committee that there are a number of continuous improvement opportunities for the Directorate over the next 18 months. These include exploring the inclusion of Modern Apprenticeship Roles within Health Improvement, supporting staff wellbeing through the Personal Development Planning and Review process, promoting use of the People Managers' Guide on HR Connect and undertaking Organisational Development sessions.

Dr Crighton showcased Workforce Development within Public Health as the Directorate's case study. This new SharePoint site provides a single, easily accessible and useable hub for

BOARD OFFICIAL

	<p>colleagues to help identify development opportunities and requirements. It offers comprehensive guides and hosts an online catalogue of relevant learning and development opportunities. Staff feedback has been positive, with 93% of those surveyed feeling the SharePoint site was easy or very easy to use and 93% feeling the site enhanced their awareness of the career advancement and training options available to them.</p> <p>Referring to a question on Performance Development Planning and Review compliance following the earlier assurance presentation, Dr Crighton highlighted system challenges impacting on this, but advised that this is a priority area for all line managers and that compliance had increased by 6% since February 2023.</p> <p>K Miles thanked all involved in the delivery of the assurance presentations, noting that the Committee had been fully assured.</p> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	
21.	<p><b>WORKFORCE STRATEGY ACTION PLAN &amp; EQUALITY UPDATE</b></p> <p>S Munce discussed the Workforce Strategy Action Plan Phase Two (Paper 23/09), updating the Staff Governance Committee on progress to date and advising the Committee that 21 of the 23 activities were complete.</p> <p>S Munce advised that the Phase Three Action Plan for 1 April 2023 to 31 March 2024 is currently being developed in partnership with the Area Partnership Forum and will be presented to the Staff Governance Committee on 22 August 2023.</p> <p>K Miles asked about the two activities that had not been completed, with S Munce updating as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Implementing Civility Saves Lives initiative – The overarching NHSGGC-wide Civility Saves Lives Group held its inaugural meeting on 16 May 2023, with a training package now developed and being tested. Further progress</li></ul>	

on this activity is expected in the coming months after challenges during the winter months in clinical settings.

- Develop workforce skills in service delivery, transformation and role design – A training needs analysis is being developed, alongside scoping exercises to ensure development provision is available to those supporting service transformation.

#### Workforce Equality Update

L Spence provided an update on Workforce Equalities, highlighting the following:

- Nine out of ten of the actions from the 2022/23 Workforce Equality Group Action Plan are complete, with only our target for increasing equalities data by 3% not achieved. However, there has been an increase in the percentage of staff about whom we hold protected characteristic information, with a continuous improvement trend over the second half of 2022/23. This will continue to be an area of focus during 2023/24, with initiatives being embedded to further drive improvement.
- The 2023/24 Workforce Equality Group Action Plan is currently being developed in partnership with the Staff Forums and Network.
- An annual programme of equalities related activities will continue in 2023/24.
- NHSGGC is holding a first Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Conference in June 2023, bringing together people managers from across the Board, to further embed our commitment to equity at every level.

A Cameron-Burns highlighted the recent change in email font to default Arial 14 and asked when this will be applied more widely in the Board. LS advised that Workforce Equality Group papers will all be issued in Arial 14 and that further rollout will then be discussed.

#### Staff Experience Video

A MacPherson introduced a video that highlighted the lived experience of a member of the BME Staff Network, who had

**L  
Spence**

BOARD OFFICIAL

	<p>volunteered to share their experience of the first wave of COVID-19. The video was created on the back of an idea discussed by the Staff Governance Committee to share the lived experience of staff.</p> <p>M Ashraf highlighted the importance of showcasing such lived experience and the learning that can be drawn from it.</p> <p>The Committee welcomed the video and noted further examples will come to future meetings.</p> <p>K Miles thanked S Munce, L Spence and A MacPherson for the update, noting that the Committee had been fully assured.</p> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	
<b>22.</b>	<p><b>STAFF GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT</b></p> <p>A MacPherson discussed the draft annual report (Paper 23/10) which describes the purpose and composition of the Staff Governance Committee, the business items considered, and key outcomes identified through the presentations heard by the Committee during 2022/23.</p> <p>K Miles highlighted that the report reflects a well-supported Board Committee and that neither of the Co-Chairs had any amendments to recommend.</p> <p>The Staff Governance Committee approved the draft Annual Report of Staff Governance 2022/23, for submission to the Area Partnership Forum and NHSGGC Board.</p> <p><u>APPROVED</u></p>	
<b>23.</b>	<p><b>MEDICAL REVALIDATION</b></p> <p>Dr Armstrong introduced Dr Graham, who discussed a report (Paper 23/11), which summarised the progress made in relation to appraisal and revalidation.</p> <p>Dr Graham advised that there is a process in place to ensure that all appraisals carried out in 2022/23 meet the General Medical</p>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

Council (GMC) core requirements, whilst continuing to focus on doctors' wellbeing. The Committee were also advised that succession planning is in place to ensure there are a sufficient number of trained appraisers to undertake appraisals within each Sector/Directorate as appraisers retire and/or demit from the role. Dr Graham advised that the majority of doctors were able to successfully complete their appraisal and provide the necessary supporting documentation such as patient and colleague feedback, with completion rates now similar to those seen before the pandemic (82% for 2022/23).

Dr Graham highlighted that during the 2022/23, 495 Clinical Fellows were appointed, marking a 29% increase on 2017/18. The reasons for this are multifactorial and include changing demographics of junior doctors, their personal choices and career plans, service need and development. NHSGGC is not an outlier and this increase in Clinical Fellow posts is reflective of a national trend.

Dr Graham also advised that there has been an increase in the number of doctors joining the Medical Staffbank, with a total of 139 bank doctors (who work exclusively for the Medical StaffBank) who required appraisal in 2022/23. This is an increase on the 55 bank doctors requiring to be appraised in 2017/18. Due to the peripatetic nature of their work, the number of bank doctors at any point in time can fluctuate but overall the numbers are steadily increasing year on year.

Dr Graham highlighted key objectives for 2023/24, which include:

- Continuing to ensure that all appraisals carried out in 2023/24 meet the GMC core requirements, whilst continuing to focus on the doctors' wellbeing.
- Establishing a central pool of trained appraisers in 2023/24, who have the flexibility to take forward appraisals for junior doctors on the Medical Bank.
- Continuing to ensure there are a sufficient number of trained appraisers to undertake appraisals within each Sector/Directorate.
- Promoting the electronic system for gathering patient feedback as an alternative to the paper based system to support.



BOARD OFFICIAL

	<p>Dr Ryan asked about Peer Support in relation to doctor wellbeing, with Dr Graham confirming that NHSGGC have developed a number of resources for staff well-being, in particular Peer Support, which is now accessible across all services in NHSGGC and available to all medical staff.</p> <p>E Quail asked whether the impact assessment of this work on Better Value should be positive rather than neutral, with it being agreed that positive is more reflective.</p> <p>The Committee noted that NHSGGC has a robust appraisal and revalidation process and that local guidance is in accordance with that provided nationally. Appraisal and revalidation rates are in-line with other Health Boards in Scotland.</p> <p>Dr Armstrong providing a General Medical Council / Deanery update for Medicine at the Queen Elizabeth University Hospital, which is subject to Enhanced Monitoring, highlighting that the area is down to five recommendations from the original 19. Dr Armstrong advised that considerable work had been undertaken and that the next step was to submit an action plan, with a further visit scheduled for 2024, with a desire to move out of Enhanced Monitoring.</p> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	
<p><b>24.</b></p>	<p><b>STAFF GOVERNANCE PERFORMANCE REPORT</b></p> <p>S Munce discussed the Staff Governance Performance Management Report (Paper 23/12), providing an update on workforce data and performance as at 31 March 2023. The following was highlighted:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Establishment position trends and projections for Nursing and Midwifery staff – Registered Nurses and Health Care Support Workers;</li><li>• Establishment position overview for Nursing and Midwifery, Senior Medical and Dental, Allied Health Professionals, Administrative Services and Support Services staff;</li><li>• Staff turnover, starters and leavers trends and projections;</li></ul>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sickness absence trend and projection, with this now including Covid absence;</li> <li>• Statutory and Mandatory training compliance;</li> <li>• Personal Development Plan and Review completion;</li> <li>• Workforce Equality Information and the reduction in the amount of missing information.</li> </ul> <p>Dr Ryan asked about the impact of recent call-out arrangements by the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service, with A MacPherson confirming that this had been considered by the Estates and Facilities Directorate to ensure appropriate mitigation is in place.</p> <p>Cllr McDiarmid asked whether there is data for how long leavers have been in post and whether it is possible to include this within the Performance Report. S Munce confirmed that information is available, with K Miles noting it may be useful to consider including any trends in relation to this.</p> <p>M Ashraf asked about the high level of Personal Development Planning and Review compliance within the Finance Directorate and whether an exit interview process was fully embedded. A MacPherson advised that there had been a management focus within Finance to drive the improvement and that fully embedding an exit interview process was a current priority for Heads of Human Resources.</p> <p>A Cameron-Burns asked whether exit interviews could be completed when individuals change roles, with A MacPherson advising that many individuals change roles internally, with the current priority focus on completing exit interviews and identifying any trends for those leaving the Board.</p> <p>K Miles thanked S Munce for the update, noting that the Committee had been fully assured.</p> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	<p><b>S Munce/ C Rennie</b></p>
<p><b>25.</b></p>	<p><b>AREA PARTNERSHIP FORUM</b></p> <p>A Cameron-Burns discussed the Area Partnership Forum (APF) update (Paper 23/13), highlighting the following:</p>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• The Area Partnership Forum received an overview on the role and remit of the Greater Glasgow and Clyde Healthcare Charity its key principles and types of Endowment Fund available. Co-Chairs of the Area Partnership Forum have asked members for suggestions for possible bids.</li><li>• The Chief Executive Officer of the NHS Credit Union gave an overview of its role and remit, with members welcoming the opportunity to learn what financial wellbeing benefits the NHS Credit Union could offer.</li><li>• The Head of Health and Safety shared an update on Safety, Health and Wellbeing. The Forum welcomed assurance that all stakeholders will be engaged with and there is a focus on growing and developing our health and safety culture.</li></ul> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	
<p><b>26.</b></p>	<p><b>HUMAN RESOURCES RISK REGISTER</b></p> <p>A Gibson discussed the Human Resources Risk Register (Paper 23/14), highlighting that the risks were reviewed by the Human Resources Senior Management Team in April 2023. The following amendments to the Risk Register were proposed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Succession Planning – Proposed risk score reduction from four (Medium) to two (Low). All Directorates now have succession lists for senior management team level positions which have been agreed with the Director following career conversations taking place through PDPs.</li><li>• Industrial Action – Proposed risk score reduction from 20 (Very High) to 12 (High). This is due to the recent agreements with Trade Unions in relation to Agenda for Change ballots. Although reduced, this remains a high risk due to the potential for industrial action for Junior Doctors and Dentists.</li></ul> <p>Dr Ryan queried why the Industrial Action risk had reduced prior to the Junior Doctor pay offer, with A MacPherson and A Gibson advising that when the risk was scored originally in October 2022, the risk applied to a broader range of staff groups, with a greater uncertainty. It was noted that the amended risk score is still “high”.</p>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

	<p>The Committee approved the updated risks, scores and mitigating actions in place to reduce these risks. Mitigation and contingency planning.</p> <p><u>APPROVED</u></p>	
<p><b>27.</b></p>	<p><b>ANNUAL REVIEW OF COMMITTEE TERMS OF REFERENCE</b></p> <p>K Donald discussed a report (Paper 23/15), highlighting that the Membership section of the Terms of Reference have been updated to ensure consistency with the Board's other Standing Committees. In addition, a key duty around monitoring and scrutinising key data and information as per the Board's Assurance Information Framework as part of Active Governance, has been added. The Committee approved the updated Terms of Reference.</p> <p><u>APPROVED</u></p>	
<p><b>28.</b></p>	<p><b>REMUNERATION COMMITTEE UPDATE – 7 MARCH 2023</b></p> <p>A Cameron-Burns provided an update on the Remuneration Committee meeting held on 7 March 2023, highlighting the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• That the update on Executive and Senior Manager (ESM) changes was welcomed and noted;</li> <li>• That the Remuneration Committee had noted an update on ESM Pay Arrangements for 2022/23;</li> <li>• That assurance on the Discretionary Points process had been provided;</li> <li>• That the Remunerations Committee's Terms of Reference had been approved.</li> </ul> <p>A Cameron-Burns advised that the next meeting will take place on 28 June 2023, where the Remuneration Committee will consider performance appraisal outcomes for the ESM cohort.</p> <p><u>ASSURANCE NOTED</u></p>	

BOARD OFFICIAL

<p><b>29.</b></p>	<p><b>CLOSING REMARKS AND KEY MESSAGES TO THE BOARD</b></p> <p>K Miles thanked all presenters, contributors to discussions during the meeting and those involved preparing papers.</p> <p>K Miles highlighted a Reservist event that took place on 19 May, celebrating the importance of NHSGGC's relationship with the Armed Forces and providing an opportunity to hear more about the activities and experiences undertaken in Reserve Units. K Miles added that a number of Board Members, including A Cowan (Board Champion) and F Shennan, C McDiarmid and A MacPherson from the Staff Governance Committee were in attendance and extended thanks on behalf of the Committee to all who made the event a success.</p> <p>Key messages to the Board will be included in the Co-Chairs' report to the 27 June 2023 Board meeting and include the Assurance Presentations, Workforce Strategy Action Plan update, Medical Revalidation assurance and approval of the Committee's 2022/23 Annual Report and the Human Resources Risk Register.</p>	
<p><b>30.</b></p>	<p><b>DATE &amp; TIME OF NEXT MEETING</b></p> <p>The next meeting of the Staff Governance Committee will be held on Tuesday 22 August 2023 at 1.30pm.</p>	
	<p>The meeting ended at 1525hrs.</p>	